UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER OF PATENTS AND TRADEMARKS
Washington, D.C. 20231
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
09/447,443	11/22/1999	PRASANTA BEHERA	NETS0059	3814

22862	7590	01/29/2002

GLENN PATENT GROUP
3475 EDISON WAY
SUITE L
MENLO PARK, CA 94025

EXAMINER
DODDS, HAROLD E

ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
2177	

DATE MAILED: 01/29/2002

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

PTO-90C (Rev. 07-01)

	Application No.	Applicant(s)	
Office Action Summary	09/447,443	BEHERA, PRASANTA	
	Examiner	Art Unit	
	Harold E. Dodds, Jr.	2177	

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE *3* MONTH(S) FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.
- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If the period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a reply within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) days will be considered timely.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133).
- Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

1) ☐ Responsive to communication(s) filed on _____ .

2a) ☐ This action is **FINAL**.   2b) ☒ This action is non-final.

3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

4) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are pending in the application.

    4a) Of the above claim(s) _____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.

5) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are allowed.

6) ☒ Claim(s) *1-27* is/are rejected.

7) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are objected to.

8) ☐ Claim(s) _____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.

10) ☒ The drawing(s) filed on *22 November 1999* is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.

    Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).

11) ☐ The proposed drawing correction filed on _____ is: a) ☐ approved b) ☐ disapproved by the Examiner.

    If approved, corrected drawings are required in reply to this Office action.

12) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. §§ 119 and 120

13) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).

    a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some * c) ☐ None of:

        1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.

        2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____ .

        3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

    * See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

14) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for domestic priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(e) (to a provisional application).

    a) ☐ The translation of the foreign language provisional application has been received.

15) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for domestic priority under 35 U.S.C. §§ 120 and/or 121.

Attachment(s)

1) ☒ Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)
2) ☒ Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)
3) ☒ Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449) Paper No(s) *6* .

4) ☐ Interview Summary (PTO-413) Paper No(s). _____ .
5) ☐ Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152)
6) ☐ Other: .

DETAILED ACTION

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103

1.   The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for

all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

> (a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set
> forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and
> the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the
> invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains.
> Patentability shall not be negatived by the manner in which the invention was made.

2.   Claims 1-27 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable

over Liles et al. (U.S. Patent No. 5,880,731), Albrect et al. (U.S. Patent No. (5,950,011),

Janis (U.S. Patent No. 5,263,165), and Cutler et al. (U.S. Patent No. 5,129,083).

3.   Liles rendered obvious independent claims 1, 10, and 19 by the following:

"...providing a user defined...list..." at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines, 1-2.

"...containing user identifications..." at col. 7, lines 12-14.

"...user defined..." at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines, 1-2.

"...referring to said user defined...list..." at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines, 1-2.

"...allowing said...user identifications..." at col. 7, lines 12-14.

Liles does not teach the reading of a set of attributes, using a system

administrator, using access control commands, and having read access.

4.   However, Albrecht teaches the reading of a set of attributes as follows:

"...to read a specified set of attributes..." at col. 9, lines 57-58.

"...listing the user attributes..." at col. 9, lines 57-58.

"...read access to said user attributes..." at col. 9, lines 57-58.

It would have been obvious to one ordinarily skilled in the art at the time of the

invention to allow the designated users the ability to read a set of attributes for user

convenience.

Albrecht does not teach the using a system administrator, using access control

commands, and having read access.

5.   However Janis teaches the using a system administrator and using access

control commands as follows:

"...providing a system administrator defined..." at col. 5, lines 32-36.

"...access control commands..." at col. 5, lines 29-32.

"...access control command..." at col. 5, lines 29-32.

"...administrator has selected..." at col. 5, lines 32-36.

"...access control command..." at col. 5, lines 29-32.

It would have been obvious to one ordinarily skilled in the art at the time of the

invention to have a system administrator who could use access control commands to

define access control for the security of the system.

Janis does not teach the use of read access control.

6.   However Cutler teaches the use of read access control as follows:

"...read list..." at col. 23, lines 56-58.

"...for read access..." at col. 23, lines 56-58.

"...read access..." at col. 23, lines 56-58.

It would have been obvious to one ordinarily skilled in the art at the time of the

invention to allow the users identified in the list of user identifications read access to the

files in order to provide system security and for user convenience.

7.   Janis rendered obvious independent claims 5, 14, and 23 by the following:

"...providing a system administrator..." at col. 5, lines 32-36.

"...defined...access control command..." at col. 5, lines 29-32.

"...administrator has selected..." at col. 5, lines 32-36.

"...providing a system administrator..." at col. 5, lines 32-36.

"...defined...access control command..." at col. 5, lines 29-32.

"...administrator has selected..." at col. 5, lines 32-36.

"...administrator has selected..." at col. 5, lines 32-36.

"...administrator has selected..." at col. 5, lines 32-36.

"...administrator has selected..." at col. 5, lines 32-36.

"...administrator has selected ..." at col. 5, lines 32-36.

"...access control command..." at col. 5, lines 29-32.

"...access control command ..." at col. 5, lines 29-32.

Janis does not teach the lists of user attributes, user defined lists, user

identification lists, reading user attributes, writing user attributes, read lists, write lists,

read access, write access, and the execution of programs.

8.   However, Albrecht teaches the use of lists user attributes, the reading of

user attributes, and the writing of user attributes as follows:

"...that lists the user attributes..." at col. 9, lines 57-58.

"...that lists the user attributes..." at col. 9, lines 57-58.

"...to read said user attributes..." at col. 9, lines 57-58.

"...to write said user attributes..." at col. 9, lines 59-60.

"...client read access to one of the user attributes..." at col. 9, lines 57-58.

"...client write access to one of the user attributes..." at col. 9, lines 59-60.

It would have been obvious to one ordinarily skilled in the art at the time of the

invention to allow the designated users the ability to read or write a set of attributes for

user convenience.

Albrecht does not teach the user defined lists, user identification lists, read lists,

write lists, read access, write access, and the execution of programs.

9.   However, Liles teaches the use of user defined lists and user identification

lists as follows:

"...for user defined...access..." at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines, 1-2.

"...for user defined...access..." at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines, 1-2.

"...providing a plurality of user defined...lists..." at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines,

1-2.

"...containing user identifications..." at col. 7, lines 12-14.

"...for user defined..." at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines, 1-2.

"...providing a plurality of user defined...lists..." at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines,

1-2.

"...containing user identifications..." at col. 7, lines 12-14.

"...for user defined..." at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines, 1-2.

"...for user defined..." at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines, 1-2.

"...list of the owner of the attribute..." at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines, 1-2.

"...for user defined..." at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines, 1-2.

"...list of the owner of the attribute..." at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines, 1-2.

It would have been obvious to one ordinarily skilled in the art at the time of the invention to allow a user to define a list of other users that could have access to his or her files by using a list of user identifications for the convenience of the making the assignment of access rights and for the convenience of the other users desiring to have access to his or her files.

Liles does not teach the use of read lists, write lists, read access, write access, and the execution of programs.

10.   However Cutler teaches the use of read access control, write access control, and using the access control to allow execution of programs as follows:

"...read access..." at col. 23, lines 56-58.

"...write access..." at col. 23, lines 58-60.

"...read list..." at col. 23, lines 56-58.

"...read access..." at col. 23, lines 56-58.

"...write list.." at col. 23, lines 58-60.

"...write access..." at col. 23, lines 58-60.

"...read access occurs..." at col. 23, lines 56-58.

"...are used to determine if said client has permission to execute..."col. 22, lines 45-50.

"...read access.." at col. 23, lines 56-58.

"...write access occurs.." at col. 23, lines 58-60.

"...are used to determine if said client has permission to execute..." col. 22, lines 45-50.

"...write access..." at col. 23, lines 58-60.

It would have been obvious to one ordinarily skilled in the art at the time of the invention to allow the users identified in the list of user identifications read access to the files, to allow the users identified in the list of user identifications write access to the files, and to allow programs to execute on data that has the proper access rights assigned to the users of these programs in order to provide system security and for user convenience.

11.   Liles rendered obvious independent claims 6, 15, and 24 by the following:

"...providing a user defined...list..." at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines, 1-2.

"...containing user identifications..." at col. 7, lines 12-14.

"...user defined..." at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines, 1-2.

"...referring to said user defined...list..." at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines, 1-2.

"...allowing said...user identifications..." at col. 7, lines 12-14.

Liles does not teach the writing of a set of attributes, using a system administrator, using access control commands, and having write access.

12.   However, Albrecht teaches the writing of a set of attributes as follows:

"...to write a specified set of attributes..." at col. 9, lines 59-60.

"...listing the user attributes..." at col. 9, lines 59-60.

"...write access to said user attributes..." at col. 9, lines 59-60.

It would have been obvious to one ordinarily skilled in the art at the time of the invention to allow the designated users the ability to write a set of attributes for user convenience.

Albrecht does not teach the using a system administrator, using access control commands, and having write access.

13.   However Janis teaches the using a system administrator and using access control commands as follows:

"...providing a system administrator defined..." at col. 5, lines 32-36.

"...access control command..." at col. 5, lines 29-32.

"...administrator has selected..." at col. 5, lines 32-36.

"...access control command..." at col. 5, lines 29-32.

"...access control command..." at col. 5, lines 29-32.

It would have been obvious to one ordinarily skilled in the art at the time of the invention to have a system administrator who could use access control commands to define access control for the security of the system.

Janis does not teach the use of write access control.

14.   However Cutler teaches the use of read access control as follows:

"...write list..." at col. 23, lines 58-60.

"...for write access..." at col. 23, lines 58-60.

"...write access..." at col. 23, lines 58-60.

It would have been obvious to one ordinarily skilled in the art at the time of the

invention to allow the users identified in the list of user identifications write access to the

files in order to provide system security and for user convenience.

15.   As per claims 2, 11, and 20, the "...read access...," is taught by Cutler at

col. 23, lines 56-58,

the "...access control command...," is taught by Janis at col. 5, lines 29-32,

the "...according to the attribute being accessed...," is taught by Albrecht at col. 9, lines

57-58,

the "...refers to the read list...," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 56-58,

the "...list of the owner...," is taught by Liles at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines 1-2,

the "...of the attribute being accessed...," is taught by Albrecht at col. 9, lines 57-58,

the "...to determine if said client has permission to execute...," is taught by Cutler at col.

22, lines 45-50,

and the "...read access..," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 56-58

16.   As per claims 3, 12, and 21, the "...providing a user defined...list...," is

taught by Liles at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines 1-2,

the "...write list...," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 58-60,

the "...list containing user identifications...," is taught by Liles at col. 7, lines 12-14,

the "...that are allowed to write a specified set of attributes...," is taught by Albrecht at

col.. 9, lines 59-60,

the "...providing a system administrator...," is taught by Janis at col. 5, lines 32-36,

the "...defined...access control command...," is taught by Janis at col. 5, lines 29-32,

the "...write access...," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 58-60,

the "...write access...," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 58-60,

the "...access control command...," is taught by Janis at col. 5, lines 29-32,

the "...listing the user attributes...," is taught by Albrecht at col. 9, lines 59-60,

the "...said administrator has selected..." is taught by Janis at col. 5, lines 32-36,

the "...for user defined...access...," is taught by Liles at col. 13, lines 65-67, and col. 14,

lines 1-2,

the "...write access...," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 58-60,

the "...write access...," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 58-60,

the "...access control command referring to...," is taught by Janis at col. 5, lines 29-32,

the "...user defined...list ...," is taught by Liles at col. 13, lines 65-67, and col. 14, lines 1-

2,

the "...write list...," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 58-60,

the "...list...user identifications...," is taught by Liles at col. 7, lines 12-14,

and the "...write access to said user attributes...," is taught by Albrecht at col. 9, lines

59-60.

17.   As per claims 4, 13, and 22, the "...write access...," is taught by Cutler at

col. 23, lines 58-60,

the "...access control command...," is taught by Janis at col. 5, lines 29-32,

the "...according to the attribute being accessed...," is taught by Albrecht at col. 9, lines

59-60,

the "...refers to the write list...," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 58-60,

the "...list of the owner...," is taught by Liles at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines 1-2,

the "...of the attribute being accessed...," is taught by Albrecht at col. 9, lines 59-60,

the "...to determine if said client has permission to execute...," is taught by Cutler at col. 22, lines 45-50,

and the "...write access..," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 58-60.

18.   As per claims 7, 16, and 25, the "...write access...," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 58-60,

the "...access control command...," is taught by Janis at col. 5, lines 29-32,

the "...according to the attribute being accessed...," is taught by Albrecht at col. 9, lines 59-60,

the "...refers to the write list...," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 58-60,

the "...list of the owner...," is taught by Liles at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines 1-2,

the "...of the attribute being accessed...," is taught by Albrecht at col. 9, lines 59-60,

the "...to determine if said client has permission to execute...," is taught by Cutler at col. 22, lines 45-50,

and the "...write access..," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 58-60.

19.   As per claims 8, 17, and 26, the "...providing a user defined...list...," is taught by Liles at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines 1-2,

the "...read list...," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 56-58,

the "...list containing user identifications...," is taught by Liles at col. 7, lines 12-14,

the "...that are allowed to read a specified set of attributes...," is taught by Albrecht at col.. 9, lines 57-58,

the "...providing a system administrator...," is taught by Janis at col. 5, lines 32-36,

"...defined...access control command...," is taught by Janis at col. 5, lines 29-32,

the "...read access...," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 56-58,

the "...read access...," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 56-58,

the "...access control command...," is taught by Janis at col. 5, lines 29-32,

the "...listing the user attributes...," is taught by Albrecht at col. 9, lines 57-58,

the "...said administrator has selected...," is taught by Janis at col. 5, lines 32-36,

the "...for user defined...access...," is taught by Liles at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14,

lines 1-2,

the "...read access...," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 56-58,

the "...read access...," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 56-58,

the "...access control command referring to...," is taught by Janis at col. 5, lines 29-32,

the "...user defined...list ...," is taught by Liles at col. 13, lines 65-67, and col. 14, lines 1-

2,

the "...read list...," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 56-58,

the "...list...user identifications...," is taught by Liles at col. 7, lines 12-14,

and the "...read access to said user attributes...," is taught by Albrecht at col. 9, lines 57-

58.

     20.   As per claims 9, 18, and 27, the "...read access...," is taught by Cutler at

col. 23, lines 56-58,

the "...access control command...," is taught by Janis at col. 5, lines 29-32,

the "...according to the attribute being accessed...," is taught by Albrecht at col. 9, lines

57-58,

the "...refers to the read list...," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 56-58,

the "...list of the owner...," is taught by Liles at col. 13, lines 65-67 and col. 14, lines 1-2,

the "...of the attribute being accessed...," is taught by Albrecht at col. 9, lines 57-58,

the "...to determine if said client has permission to execute...," is taught by Cutler at col.

22, lines 45-50,

and the "...read access..," is taught by Cutler at col. 23, lines 56-58.

Conclusion

21.   Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from

the examiner should be directed to Harold E. Dodds, Jr. whose telephone number is

(703)-305-1802. The examiner can normally be reached on Monday - Friday 8:00 -

4:30.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's

supervisor, John E. Breene can be reached on (703)-305-9790. The fax phone

numbers for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned are (703)-

305-9730 for regular communications and 703-746-7238 for After Final

communications.

Any inquiry of a general nature or relating to the status of this application or

proceeding should be directed to the receptionist whose telephone number is (703)-

305-3900.

Harold E. Dodds, Jr.

Harold E. Dodds, Jr.
Patent Examiner
January 25, 2002

John E. Breene

JOHN BREENE
SUPERVISORY PATENT EXAMINER
TECHNOLOGY CENTER 2100

Dear Patent and Trademark Office Customer:

The Technical Support Staff of Technology Center 2100 has undertaken continuous quality improvement efforts to ensure that the accompanying correspondence meets high quality standards, and focuses on good customer service. It is important to us that you are satisfied with the services we provide.

If the contents of the attached correspondence has any clerical omissions, e.g., missing references or pages, illegible text, other problems or concerns of this nature which you wish to bring to my attention, please call or fax me as soon as possible. I will take the appropriate action to expedite the necessary corrections.

Verlene D. Green
Head, Supervisory Legal Instruments Examiner
Technology Center 2100
(703) 305-4376

Fax No. (703) 308-9051 or (703) 308-9052

Attention: Policy on Returning Phone Calls

A PTO-wide customer service standard is if a PTO employee being called is not available, they will return your call by the next business day, or, if you request, an alternate point of contact will be provided. Technology Center 2100 is committed to meeting this service standard. If you have called any employee in our Technology Center and have not received a return phone call within one (1) business day or have not been provided another point of contact, please contact the Technology Center at 703-306-5631. We ensure that you will receive a return phone call, from an employee with the ability to assist you, within four (4) business hours of this contact. We appreciate your help in assisting us to help you.